## Ex. 3 - 5 U.S.C. § 7114(b)(4)

From: "Krebs, Ken" < krebs.ken@epa.gov>
Date: July 13, 2022 at 4:46:46 PM EDT
To: "Shaw, Betsy" < Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>

Cc: "Palma, Elizabeth" <Palma. Elizabeth@epa.gov>, "Howell, Joyce" <Howell.Joyce@epa.gov>, "Davis,

Nikki" <davis.nikki@epa.gov>, "Selbst, Elizabeth" <selbst.elizabeth@epa.gov>

Subject: Remote Work Denial Step One Grievance, Elizabeth Selbst

## AFGE LOCAL 3347 Research Triangle Park, NC

TO: Elizabeth Shaw, EPA Office of Air and Radiation, Deputy Assistant Administrator

FROM: Ken Krebs, President, AFGE Local 3347

SUBJECT: Step One Grievance, Elizabeth Selbst

DATE: 13 July 2022

AFGE Local 3347 is filing this grievance on behalf of Elizabeth Selbst in accordance with the provisions of Article 22 of the Interim Collective Bargaining Agreement. Elizabeth Selbst works in EPA's Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards, Air Quality Policy Division.

Elizabeth Selbst submitted her Remote Work application to her supervisor, Elizabeth Palma, on 15 March 2022. Elizabeth Selbst received notice of the denial and a written justification of the denial of her Remote Work request from you as the deciding official on 14 June 2022. The denial of Elizabeth Selbst's Remote Work request is unreasonable and based upon factually incorrect assumptions and, therefore, violates Section 10.A of the Remote Work article.

To resolve this matter, the Local is requesting that Elizabeth Selbst's Remote Work request be approved, and that Elizabeth Selbst continue working remotely full-time until the application is approved.

Please direct all communications regarding this matter directly to me as the AFGE Steward for this matter.

Thank you,

Ken Krebs

cc Elizabeth Selbst Elizabeth Palma, Supervisory Environmental Policy Analyst Ken Krebs, President AFGE Local 3347 Joyce Howell, Executive Vice President & Chief Negotiator, AFGE Council 238 Nikki Davis, LER

Ken Krebs Local 3347 President American Federation of Government Employees E-343-04, 109 T.W. Alexander Drive Research Triangle Park, NC 27711 (919) 541-2850 (919) 357-5465 Cell

Please consider joining your Union at: <u>Join.AFGE.org</u>

krebs.ken@epa.gov Kenneth.krebs@gmail.com

"Electric communication will never be a substitute for the face of someone who with their soul encourages another person to be brave and true."

- Charles Dickens

#### Message

From: Shaw, Betsy [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP

(FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=31CA1476A7674825A131CB2C0D6C88C8-BSHAW03]

**Sent**: 7/27/2022 2:35:27 PM

To: Monroe, Scott [Monroe.Scott@epa.gov]

Subject: Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Attachments: Elizabeth Selbst\_Step 1 response 7~28~22.pdf

M	es	sa	g	e

Ex. 3 - 5 U.S.C. § 7114(b)(4)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

# Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

### **ROUTING SHEET – REQUEST FOR REMOTE WORK**

**Instructions:** After receiving a remote work application, first line supervisors are to provide the information necessary to fully review the remote work request.

Once the information below is complete, this form should be:

- Signed off by the first line supervisor.
- This document should then be submitted, along with the remote work application, to your organization's designated point of contact **within 7 days** of the employee's submission of remote work application to the supervisor.

Name of employee requesting remote work:	Elizabeth Selbst
Employee title/series/grade and any informal title (e.g. Physical Scientist - OSC):	Economist, GS-0110-13/07
EPA Program or Region	EPA/OAR/OAQPS/AQPD/GSG
EPA Office location:	RTP
Employee Bargaining Union (if applicable)	AFGE
Distance, in miles (as the crow flies), between EPA office location and employee's proposed remote work location (RWL). Calculate <a href="https://example.com/here/here/">here</a> :	633 miles

	Section 1: Portability of Work	YES	NO
1	Is 100% of the employee's work portable?	<b>V</b>	
	If you marked "No" to question #1, please explain:		
2	Are the employee's duties likely to change in the future?		V
	If you marked "Yes" to question #2, please explain:		
3	Can the employee perform all of their tasks and work assignments at least equally effectively at the remote work location (considering quality, quantity, speed, manner of performance, other factors)?	•	
	If you marked "No" to question #3, please explain:		
4	Would approving the proposed remote work location require reassignment of current work or tasks to other staff?  Please ensure you are considering all tasks (e.g. mail, records management)		V

	If you marked "Yes" to question #4, please explain:		
5	Estimate how often (per year) the employee's work requires access to in-office resources (e.g. PIV Card, IT services, GOV, field equipment, paper files, etc.)?	4 tim	es
	Section 2: Remote Work Location and Cost Analysis		
6	Is employee's proposed RWL address within 50 miles of the office (calculated above)?		<b>/</b>
7	If this is a renewal, please include the actual number of trips from the RWL to the EPA office during a typical year:	N/A	
8	Does the employee's proposed RWL affect the current locality pay?		
	If you marked "yes" to question #8, please describe the different in salary amounts indicating whether the RWL will be a cost savings or increased expense.  GS-13/7 (decreased expense): -\$4,620 Salary Table 2022-RA (incorporating the 2.2% GS increase and 20.94% locality pay) = \$117,8 Salary Table 2022-RUS (incorporating the 2.2% GS increase and 16.20% locality pay) = \$113		
9	Estimate the annual number of trips from the proposed remote work location to the EPA office per year:		
10	Estimate travel costs for each trip into the official agency worksite (i.e. office), in account with <a href="https://example.com/EPA travel guidance">EPA travel guidance</a> . CONCUR can be a good tool for estimating the cost of travel, local travel, travel within 50 miles of the official agency worksite, still requires by a supervisor and the most cost-effective mode of travel.  Lodging (4 x \$115) = \$460  M&IE (3*64+2*48) = \$288  Airfare (2*114) = \$228  Mileage (to airport)= \$151 (258 miles *58.5 cents per mile)  Misc/Other = \$250	vel. Pleas	
	<ul> <li>Please describe and estimate any increase or decrease in field travel costs, considering proposed RWL (if applicable):</li> </ul>	\$ N/A	
11	Annual transit subsidy costs at the regular work site (if applicable)?	\$ <sub>N/A</sub>	
	Section 3: Continued Effectiveness		
12	Would approving the remote work location cause any disruptions to communications with internal or external clients/customers (e.g. public, state and local entities, stakeholders)?		<b>'</b>
	If you marked "Yes" to question #12, please explain:	1	

19

Is this a supervisory position?

				YES	NO
20	Based on the criteria evaluate	d above, do you h	ave any concerns regarding th	is	
	remote work request?  If you marked "Yes" to questic	n #20 places avn	lain:		
	il you marked les to questic	ni #20, piease exp	iaiii.		
Diana					Vari
	e include a detailed list of dutie enter this information below or	•	• •		
-			•		_
pollu <sup>*</sup>	velops policies, technical guidance, a tion agencies in implementing the na	ational interstate trar	nsport program.		
	ordinates transport-related policy and eral agencies, and works closely with				
deve	loping policies and guidance.				
	nd project assignments, as directed, ordinate and facilitate bi-weekly (or a				
	e meetings. oport timely resolution of identified re	egional consistency i	ssues novel policy issues and a	dverse litigatio	ın
impa	cts associated with transport plans.		• •	avoroo migano	••
- Pre	ordinate resolution of cross-cutting ir pare and present briefings and/or co	ommunications mate	rials to internal and external stake		
- Wo	rk with Associate Division Directors,	Senior Policy Advis	ors and Division Director as need	ed/directed.	
FIRST	LINE SUPERVISOR:				
I have	e carefully reviewed the informa	tion I provided ab	ove and certify that the inforn	nation above	is true
	best of my knowledge and beli	= -	· ·		
	form the employee via email th	at "I have reviewe	d your application for remote	work, and H	have
forwa	arded it for further processing."				
		ELIZABET	H Digitally signed by ELIZABETH PALMA	001006	
Eliz	zabeth W. Palma	PALMA	Date: 2022.03.20 18:38:34 -04'00'	20/202	22
Drinto	ed Name	Cianatura	Date		
rillite	eu Ivaine	Signature	Date	7	
DECIE	DING OFFICIAL:				
After	reviewing the information provi	ided, my prelimina	iry thoughts on the above req	uest are:	
	inclined to disapprove this request for				s that
	and high degrees of collaboration and s the office as well as other OAR of				
degre	ee of in-office presence is required to	o develop and maint	ain the relationships upon which $\epsilon$	effective collab	oration
uepei	nds as well as to develop and maint	am knowledge of the	organization including other part	s or the Agend	y willi
CII-	zabeth A. Shaw	Elizabeth	Digitally signed by Elizabeth Shaw	21 22	
	Labelli A. Sliaw	Shaw	Date: 2022.05.31 09:35:13 -04'00'	31-22	

Signature

Printed Name

Date

#### To Elizabeth Selbst:

As OAR's Deciding Official, I have completed my review of your remote work application and have disapproved it.

Section 13 of the EPA/AFGE Remote Work Article states, "All disapprovals will include a statement regarding the basis for disapproval, including cost considerations if applicable." Having reviewed your application and other documentation required by the agency and consulted with your senior management, I have determined that your work does not meet the conditions for remote work eligibility in the ways listed below.

• Your work involves a high level of collaboration and interaction with internal and external stakeholders that may require in-person meetings onsite. Therefore, your work is not fully portable to the remote work location.

If your duties or other circumstances change, I will be happy to reevaluate this decision.

Elizabeth A. Shaw Deputy Assistant Administrator Office of Air and Radiation

Appendix D - EPA-AF	GE Remote Work Application/Agreement
Employee Name: Elizabeth Selbst	Job Title & Grade: Economist, GS-13
AAship/Region and Division: Office of Air and Radiation/OAQPS/AQPD	Address of Official Agency Worksite: 109 TW Alexander Dr, Research Triangle Park, NC 27711
Employee's Work Phone: 919.541.3918	Employee's Work E-mail Address: selbst.elizabeth@epa.gov
First-line Supervisor: Elizabeth Palma	First-line Supervisor's Work Phone: palma.elizabeth@epa.gov
Proposed Start Date: 04/24/22	If Temporary, Proposed End Date:
Address of Remote Work Location (Including city, sta	te and zip code):
Within same Locality Pay Area of Official Agency Wo Yes No [Changes to an LPA may take significant time to	process. Pending Agency processing, interim arrangements may be used.]
Phone Number:	Alternate Phone Number (if available):
203.219.7450	
Request:	
Check one: 7 New Request Request	est for Modification to Existing Agreement
Check if for temporary period: Temporary	
Section 2. Employee's Approved Schedule: Approved S Agency Time and Reporting System.	Schedule Attached. Future schedule changes will be approved through the
Section 3. Safety Certification	
	Safety C'hecklist" identifies significant safety standards that must be met to seek supervisor if anything changes at the location and submit a new "Employee
Section 4. Employee Certification and Signature	
Agreement. I agree to comply with the terms of the Article	derstand the EPA-AFGE Remote Work Article and this Remote Work le and will work in accordance with this Remote Work Agreement. I will adhere leave, and responsibilities for government equipment and records. I have the al duty station.
Remote Work Training taken on 7/22/19 acceptable until Remote Training developed.)	date (if available) and evidence attached. (Telework Training

Explain how you can perform all of your duties as effectively from the RWL as from the Official Agency worksite, and how approval of this request will not diminish the Agency's ability to accomplish its mission and meet its operational goals: Liz has worked as the ozone transport policy lead under the Agency's "maximum telework" status since March 2020. Her work is 100% portable and she has demonstrated the ability to work remotely with equal effectiveness with respect to quality, quantity, timeliness, customer service, and all aspects of accomplishing EPA's mission. This ability is demonstrated by serving as the Tier 1 rule lead for the 2015 ozone transport FIP, which requires collaborating with staff in multiple EPA Offices, briefing senior Agency leadership, and completing internal and external review processes. She received the highest possible summary performance ratings of "Outstanding" for FY 2020 and "Distinguished" for FY 2021. Liz will remain in regular contact with coworkers in all EPA Offices by utilizing phone, emails, instant messages, and MS Teams. Her tour of duty is aligned with core Eastern time zone business hours to minimize disruption to coworkers. In addition, she will utilize a Maxiflex schedule to remain available for key meetings outside of regularly scheduled duty hours. The proposed RWL is outside the local commuting area and provides an annual cost savings to the Agency of approximately \$4,600 (see attached for detailed cost analysis). Liz is willing to travel for essential in-person meetings. Approval/Disapproval (attach documentation): Approved Disapproved (cite reason(s) below) See attachment Date: Employee's Signature: Digitally signed by ELIZABETH Thylus sul SFLBST 3/15/22 Date: 2022.03.15 15:01:09 -04'00' Supervisor's Signature: Date: Digitally signed by ELIZABETH ELIZABETH PALMA PALMA 3/20/2022 Date: 2022.03.20 18:19:20 -04'00' AA/RA (or designee) Signature: Elizabeth Digitally signed by Date: Elizabeth Shaw Date: 2022.06.09 Shaw 11:55:27 -04'00'

**Distribution:** The supervisor and the employee should keep a copy of this form for their own records. A copy shall also be forwarded to the program/regional office remote work coordinator.

#### **PRIVACY ACT STATEMENT**

**<u>Authority</u>**: The Telework Enhancement Act of 2010 (December 9, 2010); Public Law 111–292.

<u>Purpose</u>: The information collected may be used to contact EPA personnel for the purposes of conducting business.

<u>Routine Use</u>: This information may be disclosed to a Federal, State, local agency, or other public authorities where necessary or pursuant to the Routine Uses outlined in the Privacy Act System of Records: Remote Work Application/Agreement Records.

<u>Disclosure</u>: The information you are providing is voluntary. However, failure to provide this information will prevent the EPA from approving or further processing your remote work application/agreement.

#### Message

From: Shaw, Betsy [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP

(FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=31CA1476A7674825A131CB2C0D6C88C8-BSHAW03]

**Sent**: 7/27/2022 4:31:42 PM

To: Krebs, Ken [krebs.ken@epa.gov]
CC: Nabors, Susan [Nabors.Susan@epa.gov]
BCC: Monroe, Scott [Monroe.Scott@epa.gov]

**Subject**: Remote Work Denial Step One Grievance, Elizabeth Selbst

Attachments: Elizabeth Selbst\_Step 1 response 7~27~22.pdf

Mr. Krebs,

Please see the attached file for a response to your Step 1 grievance filed July 13, 2022.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth A. Shaw Deputy Assistant Administrator Office of Air and Radiation

From: "Krebs, Ken" < krebs.ken@epa.gov>
Date: July 13, 2022 at 4:46:46 PM EDT
To: "Shaw, Betsy" < Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>

Cc: "Palma, Elizabeth" < Palma. Elizabeth@epa.gov >, "Howell, Joyce" < Howell. Joyce@epa.gov >, "Davis,

Nikki" <<u>davis.nikki@epa.gov</u>>, "Selbst, Elizabeth" <<u>selbst.elizabeth@epa.gov</u>>

Subject: Remote Work Denial Step One Grievance, Elizabeth Selbst

## AFGE LOCAL 3347 Research Triangle Park, NC

TO: Elizabeth Shaw, EPA Office of Air and Radiation, Deputy Assistant Administrator

FROM: Ken Krebs, President, AFGE Local 3347

SUBJECT: Step One Grievance, Elizabeth Selbst

DATE: 13 July 2022

AFGE Local 3347 is filing this grievance on behalf of Elizabeth Selbst in accordance with the provisions of Article 22 of the Interim Collective Bargaining Agreement. Elizabeth Selbst works in EPA's Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards, Air Quality Policy Division.

Elizabeth Selbst submitted her Remote Work application to her supervisor, Elizabeth Palma, on 15 March 2022. Elizabeth Selbst received notice of the denial and a written justification of the denial of her Remote Work request from you as the deciding official on 14 June 2022. The denial of Elizabeth Selbst's Remote Work request is unreasonable and based upon factually incorrect assumptions and, therefore, violates Section 10.A of the Remote Work article.

To resolve this matter, the Local is requesting that Elizabeth Selbst's Remote Work request be approved, and that Elizabeth Selbst continue working remotely full-time until the application is approved.

Please direct all communications regarding this matter directly to me as the AFGE Steward for this matter.

Thank you,

Ken Krebs

cc Elizabeth Selbst Elizabeth Palma, Supervisory Environmental Policy Analyst Ken Krebs, President AFGE Local 3347 Joyce Howell, Executive Vice President & Chief Negotiator, AFGE Council 238 Nikki Davis, LER

Ken Krebs Local 3347 President American Federation of Government Employees E-343-04, 109 T.W. Alexander Drive Research Triangle Park, NC 27711 (919) 541-2850 (919) 357-5465 Cell

Please consider joining your Union at: <u>Join.AFGE.org</u>

krebs.ken@epa.gov Kenneth.krebs@gmail.com

"Electric communication will never be a substitute for the face of someone who with their soul encourages another person to be brave and true."

- Charles Dickens

#### UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

Washington, DC, 20460



OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION

July 27, 2022

#### MEMORANDUM

FROM:

SUBJECT: Step 1 Grievance Response – Elizabeth Selbst

Elizabeth

Elizabeth A. Shaw Elizabeth Shaw Date: 2022.07.27 Shaw Deputy Assistant Administrator

Digitally signed by

TO: Ken Krebs, President

Local 3347

American Federation of Government Employees (AFGE)

You submitted a Step 1 Grievance on July 13, 2022, under the provisions of Article 22 of the EPA-AFGE Interim Collective Bargaining Agreement. This grievance involved my June 14, 2022, denial of Ms. Elizabeth Selbst's remote work application. You requested as a remedy that Ms. Selbst's application be approved and that she continue working remotely full-time.

Your grievance stated that the denial of Ms. Selbst's remote work application was "unreasonable and based upon factually incorrect assumptions." Although you provided no additional information for me to consider, such as specific details about the assumptions that you alleged were factually incorrect, in the interest of mutual understanding I have carefully reviewed her submitted application and the negotiated AFGE Remote Work Article.

Ms. Selbst is a GS-13 Economist in the Geographic Strategies Group, Air Quality Policy Division, Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards. Her work is not fully portable and consequently is not eligible for remote work. As such, I appropriately denied her remote work application. Your grievance is denied, as well as any requested remedies.

If you disagree with my decision, you may file a Step 2 grievance with Wesley Carpenter, Deputy Chief of Staff, Office of the Administrator, in accordance with Article 22 of the EPA-AFGE Interim Agreement.

cc: Susan Nabors, Human Resources Specialist, Management Services Section

Appendix D - EPA-AF	GE Remote Work Application/Agreement
Employee Name: Elizabeth Selbst	Job Title & Grade: Economist, GS-13
AAship/Region and Division: Office of Air and Radiation/OAQPS/AQPD	Address of Official Agency Worksite: 109 TW Alexander Dr, Research Triangle Park, NC 27711
Employee's Work Phone: 919.541.3918	Employee's Work E-mail Address: selbst.elizabeth@epa.gov
First-line Supervisor: Elizabeth Palma	First-line Supervisor's Work Phone: palma.elizabeth@epa.gov
Proposed Start Date: 04/24/22	If Temporary, Proposed End Date:
Address of Remote Work Location (Including city, sta	te and zip code):
Within same Locality Pay Area of Official Agency Wo Yes No [Changes to an LPA may take significant time to	process. Pending Agency processing, interim arrangements may be used.]
Phone Number:	Alternate Phone Number (if available):
203.219.7450	
Request:	
Check one: 7 New Request Request	est for Modification to Existing Agreement
Check if for temporary period: Temporary	
Section 2. Employee's Approved Schedule: Approved S Agency Time and Reporting System.	Schedule Attached. Future schedule changes will be approved through the
Section 3. Safety Certification	
	Safety C'hecklist" identifies significant safety standards that must be met to seek supervisor if anything changes at the location and submit a new "Employee
Section 4. Employee Certification and Signature	
Agreement. I agree to comply with the terms of the Article	derstand the EPA-AFGE Remote Work Article and this Remote Work le and will work in accordance with this Remote Work Agreement. I will adhere leave, and responsibilities for government equipment and records. I have the al duty station.
Remote Work Training taken on 7/22/19 acceptable until Remote Training developed.)	date (if available) and evidence attached. (Telework Training

Explain how you can perform all of your duties as effectively from the RWL as from the Official Agency worksite, and how approval of this request will not diminish the Agency's ability to accomplish its mission and meet its operational goals: Liz has worked as the ozone transport policy lead under the Agency's "maximum telework" status since March 2020. Her work is 100% portable and she has demonstrated the ability to work remotely with equal effectiveness with respect to quality, quantity, timeliness, customer service, and all aspects of accomplishing EPA's mission. This ability is demonstrated by serving as the Tier 1 rule lead for the 2015 ozone transport FIP, which requires collaborating with staff in multiple EPA Offices, briefing senior Agency leadership, and completing internal and external review processes. She received the highest possible summary performance ratings of "Outstanding" for FY 2020 and "Distinguished" for FY 2021. Liz will remain in regular contact with coworkers in all EPA Offices by utilizing phone, emails, instant messages, and MS Teams. Her tour of duty is aligned with core Eastern time zone business hours to minimize disruption to coworkers. In addition, she will utilize a Maxiflex schedule to remain available for key meetings outside of regularly scheduled duty hours. The proposed RWL is outside the local commuting area and provides an annual cost savings to the Agency of approximately \$4,600 (see attached for detailed cost analysis). Liz is willing to travel for essential in-person meetings. Approval/Disapproval (attach documentation): Approved Disapproved (cite reason(s) below) See attachment Date: Employee's Signature: Digitally signed by ELIZABETH They had I have SELBST 3/15/22 Date: 2022.03.15 15:01:09 -04'00' Supervisor's Signature: Date: Digitally signed by ELIZABETH ELIZABETH PALMA PALMA 3/20/2022 Date: 2022.03.20 18:19:20 -04'00' AA/RA (or designee) Signature: Date: Distribution: The supervisor and the employee should keep a copy of this form for their own records. A copy shall also be forwarded to the program/regional office remote work coordinator.

#### PRIVACY ACT STATEMENT

**<u>Authority</u>**: The Telework Enhancement Act of 2010 (December 9, 2010); Public Law 111–292.

<u>Purpose</u>: The information collected may be used to contact EPA personnel for the purposes of conducting business.

<u>Routine Use</u>: This information may be disclosed to a Federal, State, local agency, or other public authorities where necessary or pursuant to the Routine Uses outlined in the Privacy Act System of Records: Remote Work Application/Agreement Records.

<u>Disclosure</u>: The information you are providing is voluntary. However, failure to provide this information will prevent the EPA from approving or further processing your remote work application/agreement.

#### Message

From: Krebs, Ken [krebs.ken@epa.gov]

**Sent**: 7/13/2022 8:46:44 PM

To: Shaw, Betsy [Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov]

CC: Palma, Elizabeth [Palma.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Howell, Joyce [Howell.Joyce@epa.gov]; Davis, Nikki

[davis.nikki@epa.gov]; Selbst, Elizabeth [selbst.elizabeth@epa.gov]

Subject: Remote Work Denial Step One Grievance, Elizabeth Selbst

## AFGE LOCAL 3347 Research Triangle Park, NC

TO: Elizabeth Shaw, EPA Office of Air and Radiation, Deputy Assistant Administrator

FROM: Ken Krebs, President, AFGE Local 3347

SUBJECT: Step One Grievance, Elizabeth Selbst

DATE: 13 July 2022

AFGE Local 3347 is filing this grievance on behalf of Elizabeth Selbst in accordance with the provisions of Article 22 of the Interim Collective Bargaining Agreement. Elizabeth Selbst works in EPA's Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards, Air Quality Policy Division.

Elizabeth Selbst submitted her Remote Work application to her supervisor, Elizabeth Palma, on 15 March 2022. Elizabeth Selbst received notice of the denial and a written justification of the denial of her Remote Work request from you as the deciding official on 14 June 2022. The denial of Elizabeth Selbst's Remote Work request is unreasonable and based upon factually incorrect assumptions and, therefore, violates Section 10.A of the Remote Work article.

To resolve this matter, the Local is requesting that Elizabeth Selbst's Remote Work request be approved, and that Elizabeth Selbst continue working remotely full-time until the application is approved.

Please direct all communications regarding this matter directly to me as the AFGE Steward for this matter.

Thank you,

Ken Krebs

cc Elizabeth Selbst Elizabeth Palma, Supervisory Environmental Policy Analyst Ken Krebs, President AFGE Local 3347

Joyce Howell, Executive Vice President & Chief Negotiator, AFGE Council 238

Nikki Davis, LER

Ken Krebs
Local 3347 President
American Federation of Government Employees
E-343-04, 109 T.W. Alexander Drive
Research Triangle Park, NC 27711
(919) 541-2850
(919) 357-5465 Cell

Please consider joining your Union at: <u>Join.AFGE.org</u>

krebs.ken@epa.gov Kenneth.krebs@gmail.com

"Electric communication will never be a substitute for the face of someone who with their soul encourages another person to be brave and true."

- Charles Dickens

# Ex. 3 - 5 U.S.C. § 7114(b)(4)

From: "Krebs, Ken" < krebs.ken@epa.gov > Date: July 13, 2022 at 4:46:46 PM EDT
To: "Shaw, Betsy" < Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov >

Cc: "Palma, Elizabeth" <Palma.Elizabeth@epa.gov>, "Howell, Joyce" <Howell.Joyce@epa.gov>, "Davis,

Nikki" < davis.nikki@epa.gov >, "Selbst, Elizabeth" < selbst.elizabeth@epa.gov >

Subject: Remote Work Denial Step One Grievance, Elizabeth Selbst

## AFGE LOCAL 3347 Research Triangle Park, NC

TO: Elizabeth Shaw, EPA Office of Air and Radiation, Deputy Assistant Administrator

FROM: Ken Krebs, President, AFGE Local 3347

SUBJECT: Step One Grievance, Elizabeth Selbst

DATE: 13 July 2022

AFGE Local 3347 is filing this grievance on behalf of Elizabeth Selbst in accordance with the provisions of Article 22 of the Interim Collective Bargaining Agreement. Elizabeth Selbst works in EPA's Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards, Air Quality Policy Division.

Elizabeth Selbst submitted her Remote Work application to her supervisor, Elizabeth Palma, on 15 March 2022. Elizabeth Selbst received notice of the denial and a written justification of the denial of her Remote Work request from you as the deciding official on 14 June 2022. The denial of Elizabeth Selbst's Remote Work request is unreasonable and based upon factually incorrect assumptions and, therefore, violates Section 10.A of the Remote Work article.

To resolve this matter, the Local is requesting that Elizabeth Selbst's Remote Work request be approved, and that Elizabeth Selbst continue working remotely full-time until the application is approved.

Please direct all communications regarding this matter directly to me as the AFGE Steward for this matter.

Thank you,

Ken Krebs

cc Elizabeth Selbst
Elizabeth Palma, Supervisory Environmental Policy Analyst
Ken Krebs, President AFGE Local 3347
Joyce Howell, Executive Vice President & Chief Negotiator, AFGE Council 238
Nikki Davis, LER

Ken Krebs
Local 3347 President
American Federation of Government Employees
E-343-04, 109 T.W. Alexander Drive
Research Triangle Park, NC 27711
(919) 541-2850
(919) 357-5465 Cell

Please consider joining your Union at: <u>Join.AFGE.org</u>

krebs.ken@epa.gov Kenneth.krebs@gmail.com

"Electric communication will never be a substitute for the face of someone who with their soul encourages another person to be brave and true."

- Charles Dickens

#### Message

From: Monroe, Scott [Monroe.Scott@epa.gov]

Sent: 5/26/2022 12:53:30 PM

To: Shaw, Betsy [Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov]

OAQPS RW Application - Elizabeth Selbst (3 of 3) Subject:

Attachments: Selbst, Elizabeth PD.pdf; Selbst, Elizabeth RW Application no PII.pdf; Selbst, Elizabeth RW Routing Sheet v2.pdf

Betsy,

Please sign the attached routing sheet for Elizabeth Selbst. Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Scott

					ENTAL PROTECTI					
Position Descr	iption Co	versheet (/				Position No.		2. Incumbency All	ocation C	Only?
3. Reason for Submission	*************		4. Employing Office	no Location	5. Duty Stati	LA00334	***********************	May be IAed  6. BUS Code		
			Durham, NC							
		Durham, NC 7. Fair Labor Star		oonnoonnoonnoon ( aaaaaaaaaaaaaaaaaaaa	NC Statements Required		1050 9. Cybersecurity C	Inde		
Explanation (Show any positi	ions replaced)					•	a al	a. 000	oode	
Employee will be real	ligned to a ne	w Group.	Exempt - Prot		100000000000000000000000000000000000000	ncial Disclosure Requir	eq	b. 000	500000000000000000000000000000000000000	888888888888888888888888888888888888888
The Geographic Stra	tegies Group.	Employee's		15		her Positions			c. 000	
PD and major duties	will remain th	e same	Competitive 12. Competitive L	ovol Codo	13. Competi	000000000000000000000000000000000000000		14. Drug Testing		
			001	ever Code	13. Competi	uve Aled				
			15. Extramural %		16 Function	al Class Code		No 17. Medical Monit	oring	
			<25		31			omg		
			18. Position Sens	divity			No 20. Position Risk	***************************************	500000000000000000000000000000000000000	
			Non-Sensitive	•	0 - Not B			1 - Low		
			21. Emergency E		200000000000000000000000000000000000000	mental Position		23. Full Performa	nce Leve	al
			Z I. Lineigenby Li	ssenda	ZZ. Develop	mental rostion		13		,,
***************************************	**************************************		p 2000000000000000000000000000000000000		000000000000000000000000000000000000000					
24. Position Classification	ļ			Official Title	of Position		Pay Plan	Occupational C	ode	Grade
a. Official Allocation	Economist						GS	0110		13
25. Organizational Title of P	<u>I</u> osition (if differen	t from official title)			26. Name of	f Employee (if vacant, state s	uch)	1	***************************************	<u></u>
					Selbst, E	lizabeth				
	***************************************		27. De	eparment, Agency,	or Establishment Hierar	chy				
a. 1st Tier Org Code		1st Tier Org Desci	iption				••••••			
		Office of Air	and Radiation							
b. 2nd Tier Org Code		2nd Tier Org Des	cription							
LB000000		Office of Air	Quality Plannin	g and Standard	is		000000000000000000000000000000000000000	************************************	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	000000000000000000000000000000000000000
c. 3rd Tier Org Code		3rd Tier Org Desc	ription							
LBB00000 Air Quality Policy Division						***************************************			*************	
d. 4th Tier Org Code #th Tier Org Description										
LBBA0000		800000000000000000000000000000000000000	Strategies Gro	up	***************************************		*******************************		200000000000000000000000000000000000000	900000000000000000000000000000000000000
e. 5th Tier Org Code		5th Tier Org Desc	ription							
28. Supervisory Certificati Governmental functions for v						on and its organizational relat I for statutory purposes relati				
and that false or misleading	statements may c	onstitute violations		their implementing	regulations.					
a. Typed Name and Title of I	Immediate Superv	risor			b. Typed Name and T	itle of Higher-Level Superviso	or or Manager			
Elizabeth Palma, Gro	oup Leader, G	SG		***************************************	Scott Mathias, A	Acting Division Director	r. AQPD	***************************************		000000000000000000000000000000000000000
Signature				Date	Signature				Date	
ELIZABETH PALMA PALMA Date: 2020.04.15 15:38:11 -04'00'		04/15/2020	SCOTT N	MATHIAS MATH		SCOTT 7:32:50 -04'00'	04/1	5/2020		
29. Classification/Job Grading Certification: I certify that this position has been classified/grass required by Title 5, U.S. Code, in conformation with standards published by the U.S. Office of Personnel Management or, if no published standards apply directly, consistently with the most applicable published standard.			S. Office of	Information for Employees: The classification of the position may be reviewed and corrected by the agency or the U.S. Office of Personnel Management. Information on classification/job grading appeals, and complaints on exemption from FLSA, is available from the personnel office or U.S. Office of Personnel Management.					g	
a. Typed Name and Title of	Official Classifying	the Position			30. Position Classifica	ition Standards Used in Class	sifying/Grading	Position		
Joan Alapati, Contract Classification Specialist			Hdbk of Occup (	Grps & Families Dec '1	8; PCS for	Economist Seri	es,			
Signature Date				GS-0110, TS-54	December 1964, TS-4	15 April 196	3			
/S/ Joan Alapati			1/13/2015							
31. Remarks	******************************	************	************************	<u></u>	<u> </u>		********************	***************************************		
Realignment from LB	BD0000 to LE	3BA0000 effect	ive 05/10/2020	AQPD MEMO	DTD 04/16/2020 (	FPPS 20 0952325) - C	CRH			

NOTE: DO NOT print this form. Printing will disable the electronic signature features. This form will not be accepted if it is printed and scanned.

### Instructions for Completing Environmental Protection Agency Position Description Coversheet

- Enter the position number used by the agency for control purposes.
- 2. Select one.
- 3. Select one:
  - \* New the position has not previously existed.
  - \* Redescription the duties and/or responsibilities of an existing position are being changed.
  - \* Reestablish the position previously existed, but had been cancelled.
  - \* Other covers such things as change in title or occupational series with change in duties or responsibilities.
  - The "Explanation" section should be used to show the reason if "Other" is checked, as well as any position(s) replace by position number, title, pay plan, occupational
- 4. Enter geographic location by city and State (or by city and country if position is in a foreign country).
- Enter the Duty Station if different than Employing Office Location.
- 6. Enter the Bargaining Unit Status code.
- Select one. If the position is a Career Ladder then select "See Remarks" and annotate the Grade and FLSA progression in #31 Remarks.
- 8. Select one.
- 9. Enter up to three (3) cybersecurity codes.
- 10. Select one
- 11. Select one.
- Enter the Competitive Level Code determined by the agency.
- 13. Enter the Competitive Area determined by the agency.
- 14. Select "Yes" or "No".
- 15. Enter Extramural Percentage.
- 16. Functional Class Code.
- 17. Select "Yes" or "No".
- 18. Select one.
- 19. Select one.
- 20. Select one.

- 21 Select "Yes" or "No".
- 22. Select "Yes" or "No".
- 23. Enter the Full Performance Level of the position.
- 24a. Enter the Official Position Title, Pay Plan, Occupational Code, and Grade of the position.
- Enter the Organizational Title of the position if different from the Official Title.
- 26. Enter the name of the Employee; if vacant, enter "Vacant".
- 27a. (Enter the 1st Tier Org Code and Org Description. For example, H0000000 Office of Mission Support.
- 27b. Enter the 2nd Tier Org Code and Org Description, if applicable. For example, HB000000 Office of Management and Administration Cincinnati.
- 27c. Enter the 3rd Tier Org Code and Org Description, if applicable. For example, HBA00000 Human Resources Management Division.
- 27d. Enter the 4th Tier Org Code and Org Description, if applicable. For example, HBAB0000 Headquarters Operations Branch.
- 27e. Enter the 5th Tier Org Code and Org Description, if applicable.
- 28a. Enter the Name and Title of the Immediate Supervisor, and apply electronic signature and date in the space provided below.
- 28b. Enter the Name and Title of the Higher-Level Supervisor or Manager, and apply electronic signature and date in the space provided below.
- 29a. Enter the Name and Title of Official classifying the position, and apply electronic signature and date in the space provided below.
- 30. Enter the position classification/job grading standard(s) used and the date of issuance.
- 31. This section may be used for additional coding requirements or for any additional remarks.

United States Enviro	onmental Protection Agency	1. DUTY LOCAT	ION	2. POSITI	ON NUMBE	R
POS	SITION DESCRIPTION COVERSHEET N ACTION: a. Reference of Series and Date of Standards Used to	Durham (F	RTP), NC	L-FY S	Trior	
PCS for Remoment Leries, GS-0110, 75-54 Dec 1964						
	b. Title		e. Pay Plan	d. Series	c. Grade	f. CLC
Official Allocation	Economist		GS	0110	13	O0 1
4. Supervisor's Recommendation	Geonomist		650	0110	_(3	
	NAL TITLE OF POSITION (if any)	6. NAME OF EMPI	OYEE Se	(15F)	lina	har
7. ORGANIZATIO	ON (Give complete organizational breakdown)	e. Air Economic				
a. U.S. ENVIRON	MENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY	f. State 9,	Local Pi	ogram	<u>S</u>	MANAGER STREET S
b. Office of Air	and Radiation	g.				······································
	Quality Planning and Standards	h. Employing Offi		rham (RTP),	NC	***************************************
1	police purronmental Impacts Division	i. Organization Co	ode LB	CA0000		i Maria i wa
8. SUPERVISOR	Y STATUS					
for applicati position clas	or Manager. Position requires the exercise of supervisory ion of the General Schedule Supervisory Guide (GSSG) or selfication standards.  Position meets the definition of Supervisor in 5.U.S.C. 71	similar standards for n	ninimum supervi	sory responsible	ility specified	in other
GSSG.	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·					
	nt Official. Position meets the definition of Management C		03(a)(11), but do	es not meet the	GSSG defini	ition of
[ [6] Lead Positi	Manager or the definition of Supervisor in 5.U.S.C. 7103(a) ion leads a team performing one-grade interval work and me lation Guide (WLGEG) or is under a wage system and mee	ets the minimum requ	irements for app	plication of Par	t 1 of the Wor	rk Leader
directives of	f the applicable pay system.					
□ [7] Team Lead	er. Position leads a team performing two-grade interval wo	ork and meets the mini	mum requireme	nts for applicat	ion of Part II	of the
WLGEG.  [8] All Other Positions. Position does not meet any of the above definitions. This is a non-supervisor/non-managerial position.						
9. SUPERVISORY CERTIFICATION I certify that this is an accurate statement of the major duties and responsibilities of this position and its organizational relationships and that the position is necessary to carry out governmental functions for which I am responsible. The certification is made with the knowledge that this						
relationships and that information is to be us	the position is necessary to carry out governmental functions for was for statutory purposes relating to appointment and payment of I	hich I am responsible. I bublic funds, and that fal	he certification is se or misleading st	made with the ki atements may co	nstitute violatio	nis ons of such
statutes or their imple	menting regulations.	d. Typed Name a	***************************************			
Darry Weather	nead, Group Leader, AEG SLPG	Erika N. Sasse		_	wi case.	
b. Signature	c. Date	e. Signature			f. Da	ıte
SW2	atto 11/4/15	E) N Jassen 11/4/15			/4/15	
10. OFFICIAL CL	ASSIFICATION CERTIFICATION: I certify that this pos y the U.S. Office of Personnel Management or, if no published star	nition has been classified,	graded as required	l by Title 5, U.S.	Code, in confo	rmance with lards.
a. Promotion Pot						
	promotion potential to gra	de:	~			
b. PSB Risk Design	nation c. Financial Disclosure Form d. "Identical,  GGE-450 Required Allocation The	Additional" (IA)	e. FLSA Dete  ☐ NONEXEN	rmination APT MEXEM		inctional sification
☐ 2 Moderate	OGE-278 Required Amay be IA'	ed	(*check exemp	otion category)		
☐ 3 High Security Clearance	No financial disclosure	IA'ed current incumbent	Administra Professiona		ive Z	$\mathcal{L}$
Required: 🗆 Yes 🛭	□No		<u> </u>	II had austrace.		<u> </u>
	i. Check, if applicable:  I Medical Monitoring Required	i, Classifier's	Signature		j. D	ate /
1060	☐ Extramural Resources Management Duties (% of time ☐ This position is subject to random drug testing ()	ne)	leget	)	011	13/1
11. REMARKS	Al.		inisianisma fizikanianianianianianiani	1874180002804004004704704204047047047047070707070470470470		***************************************
ACCOMPANIES OF THE PROPERTY OF						

EPA Form 3150-1 (Rev 8/2009) Previous Versions are Obsolete

### ECONOMIST GS-0110-13

#### I. INTRODUCTION:

This position is located in the Office of Air and Radiation, Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards, Health and Environmental Impacts Division, Air Economics Group, located in Research Triangle Park (RTP), NC. The functions of this group are to: 1) Provide scientifically defensible and transparent economic assessments in a policy relevant timeframe; 2) Develop methodologies, models and applied tools to-provide scientifically defensible and -transparent economic analysis to EPA and other stakeholders in a policy-relevant time frame; 3) Conduct analysis of costs, economic impacts, and benefits of air quality management strategies, programs, and regulations developed throughout EPA; 4) Participate in Agency-wide assessments of the costs, economic impacts, and benefits of environmental programs and development of policies, methodologies and models for this purpose; 5) Perform and documents a wide range of economic analyses to address social cost and benefits, economic impacts, regulatory flexibility (e.g., impacts on small entities and Tribes), information collection requests, and environmental justice; 6) Collaborate with researchers throughout the Agency as well as in academic, research institutes, and other government organizations to improve the science of applied microeconomics for policy assessments; 7) Provide technical support and expertise on benefit, cost and economic impact models to regional, State, and local agencies, international agencies, Tribal agencies, and the public on the benefits and costs of improving air quality.

#### II. MAROJ DUTIES AND RESPONSIBILITIES:

Economic Assessments and Work Planning -45%

Designs and implements studies of the adverse, positive, and distributive economic consequences of environmental standards and strategies, taking into account the Division's resources, program priorities, and long-range objectives. Analytical design considerations will include potential integration of results with related cost-effectiveness, economic impact, and benefit-cost studies. The analysis may include ambient concentrations, attainment paths and compliance dates, control measures, and enforcement methods as distinct policy variables with the Clean Air Act as Amended, Paperwork Reduction Act, Regulatory Flexibility Act, Executive Order 12866, and EPA Guidelines for Regulatory Analysis prescribing the focus of the applied analysis. The analyses will vary in methodology with a comparative static framework appropriate for some applications while a disequilibrium framework is appropriate for others. The analyses will also vary in scope with some of the firm level and others at the industry, regional, national, and/or international levels. Provides inputs for briefings on costs, economic impacts, and benefits of regulatory options to high-level agency officials, including the Assistant Administrator for the Office of Air and Radiation.

Serves as senior economist responsible for providing technical and policy advice to Agency Economists and policy makers about the underpinnings to the scientific, economic, and other technical assumptions underlying the benefits and economic analyses.

In cooperation with other EPA scientists, economists, and managers; plans and develops the economic, technical, scientific, and policy basis for benefits and economic analyses.

Participates in Agency-wide assessments of the costs, benefits, and economic impacts of environmental programs and development of policies, methodologies, and models.

00

The efforts may be conducted in-house or using a combination of in-house and extramural resources. If performed exclusively in-house, the incumbent develops and secures approval of the study scope, analytical methodology and resource and time. Conducts analysis, prepares a report, and briefs higher-level management on the findings of analyses. When extramural resources are employed, prepares purchase request (consistent with the Group's contract plan), statement of work, and contractor performance evaluations to ensure effective use of extramural resources.

Performs and documents a wide range of economic analyses to address social cost and benefits, economic impacts, regulatory flexibility (e.g., impacts on small entities and Tribes), information collection requests, and environmental justice.

Direct the activities of less experienced group personnel for selected studies and analyses. May serve as a mentor for new personnel in the techniques and methods of economic analysis.

Technical Skills for Economic Assessments and Tool Development for Policy Relevant Timeframes -30%

Analyzes information and prepares study reports concerning the economic costs, benefits, and impacts of environmental quality enhancement. Responsibilities include evaluation, acquisition, maintenance, and application of these data and models to estimate the levels and distribution of these changes. Develops plans and maintains systems to assimilate existing and emerging economic data into regulation development, implementation, and environmental progress communication programs, studies may be multimedia in nature and carried out at the regional and national levels. Such studies may be used as an input in the establishment of certain standards, attainment dates, or prioritizing unfinished environmental business.

Reviews environmental, economic, and financial literature to develop, maintain, and enhance the information base necessary to conduct independent analyses of the regional, national, and international aspects of environmental quality management issues.

Maintains and enhances his/her knowledge, skills, and abilities' with respect to theoretical and applied micro-economics as well as computer-based tools for statistical and simulation and graphical presentation of data. Works closely with educational institutions, industrial, and environmental groups for the purpose of obtaining and exchanging information regarding environmental economic studies. The incumbent may be expected to work with such groups to develop joint projects in the environmental economics area.

Provides technical support and expertise on benefit, cost, and economic impact models to regional, State, and local agencies, international agencies, Tribal agencies, and the public on the benefits and costs of improving air quality.

#### Collaboration with Agency Experts and External Science Community -25%

In cooperation/coordination with other ABCG staff, other EPA scientists, and external economists and scientists to plan, develop and implement benefit and economic analyses. Serves as liaison with government and non-government scientists, policy analysts, and economists, including peer-review-bodies such as-EPA's Science-Advisor-y Board,-to-strengthen, and broaden the scientific, economic and other technical underpinnings of the benefits and economic analyses.

Collaborates with researchers throughout the Agency as well as in academic, research institutes, and





other government organizations to improve the science of applied environmental economics.

Works closely with educational institutions, industrial, and environmental groups for the purpose of obtaining and exchanging information regarding environmental economic studies. The incumbent may be expected to work with such groups to develop joint projects in the environmental economics area.

Performs other related duties as assigned.

#### III. FES FACTORS

#### Factor 1 - Knowledge Required by the Position

Mastery of advanced concepts, principles, and practices of an economic discipline in order to serve as a technical authority in the field of environmental economics. Knowledge and skill to apply the latest developments in economics to develop procedures to perform analyses-relevant to identifying and resolving air pollution problems and issues. Knowledge and skill to evaluate and incorporate the latest developments in the economic field into technical guidelines. Knowledge of related economic fields.

#### Factor 2, Supervisory Controls

The supervisor makes initial assignments in the form of functional responsibilities together with broad overall objectives and special assignments (as required) in the form of sensitive or special projects. Otherwise, assignments are either self-generated or received in accordance with established work-flow channels. The incumbent carries out work independently, interpreting policy and regulations in accordance with established objectives, resolving most conflicts, which arise, and coordinating with others as required. Problems of unusual significance are normally referred for the supervisor's views for development of a joint course of action. Completed work normally is accepted as technically accurate and is reviewed for conformance with policy.

#### Factor 3, Guidelines

Guidelines include legislation, professional literature, agency policy and regulations, and established practices. The guidelines embrace a range of administrative and technical criteria involving concepts and principles for which the employee must adapt, extend, or develop supplementary material. The incumbent must use judgment in extending or modifying guidelines, and in determining when new guidelines need to be developed.

#### Factor 4, Complexity

Assignments are of such breadth diversity, and intensity that they involve many, varied complex features. The work requires the incumbent to be especially versatile and innovative in adapting, modifying, or making compromises with standard guides and methods to originate new techniques or criteria. Individual assignments typically contain a combination of complex features which involve serious or difficult-to-resolve conflicts between analytical and management requirements.

#### Factor 5, Scope and Effect

The purpose of the work is to provide a technical authority in an economic field relevant to conducting research and development or performing analyses of air pollution-related problems and issues. The work results in standards, criteria, regulations, processes for controlling air pollution or resolving-air-

3

## POSITION CLASSIFICATION EVALUATION STATEMENT

Request No.: 15-2077640

#### I. INTRODUCTION:

- **a. Organization Location:** Office of Air and Radiation (OAR), Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards (OAQPS), Health and Environmental Impacts Division (HEID), Air Economics Group (AEG)
- b. Action Requested: Establish/Classify
- c. Proposed Classification: Economist, GS-0110-13
- d. Desk Audit or Supervisory Interview Conducted: No.
- II. REFERENCES: USOPM PCS for Economist Series, GS-0110, TS-54 December 1964

III. SERIES, TITLE, AND GRADE DETERMINATION. The purpose of this position is to designs, and implements studies of the adverse, positive, and distributive economic consequences of environmental standards and strategies. Performs and documents a wide range of economic analyses to address social cost and benefits, economic impacts, regulatory flexibility (e.g., impacts on small entities and Tribes), information collection requests, and environmental justice. Analyzes information and prepares study reports concerning the economic costs, benefits, and impacts of environmental quality enhancement. This work matches the series definition for work classified to the GS-0110 series. This series includes positions that require application of a professional knowledge of economics in the performance of duties that include; research into economic phenomena, analysis of economic data, and the preparation of interpretive report; advice and consultation on economic matters to governmental officials and private organizations or citizens, etc. The GS-0110 series is the proper series, and Economist is the proper title.

**Grade:** Grade level determination:

#### A. SCOPE OF ASSIGNMENT:

The incumbent is responsible for designing and implementing studies of the adverse, positive, and distributive economic consequences of environmental standards and strategies, taking into account the Division's resources, program priorities, and long-range objectives. The analytical design considerations will include potential integration of results with related cost-effectiveness, economic impact, and benefit-cost studies. The analysis may include ambient concentrations, attainment paths and compliance dates, control measures, and enforcement methods as distinct policy variables with the Clean Air Act as Amended, Paperwork Reduction Act, Regulatory Flexibility Act, Executive Order 12866, and EPA Guidelines for Regulatory Analysis prescribing the focus of the applied analysis. In addition, the incumbent in cooperation with other EPA scientists,

economists, and managers; plans and develops the economic, technical, scientific, and policy basis for benefits and economic analyses. The incumbent participates in Agencywide assessments of the costs, benefits, and economic impacts of environmental programs and development of policies, methodologies, and models, etc.

The GS-12 level is exceeded, assignments at this level, are characterized by the diversity of studies, where the incumbent may be responsible for a number of studies similar in size to those found at the lower levels, but which are being conducted simultaneously; for several of the small program segments typical of the GS-11 level, or for a similar pattern of duties requiring considerable planning and coordination. In addition, the variety of assignments at this level may or may not all relate to a common problem or project but in either case, the responsibility at the GS-12 is limited to the coordination and completion of the studies assigned.

Whereas at the GS-13 level, the incumbent is typically responsible for a pattern of small studies or program segments which represents in itself an integrated program. These assignments involve the initiation, formulation, planning, execution, and control of major special studies or continuing projects. The incumbent must initiate, formulate, plan, execute, coordinate, and bring such studies to meaningful conclusions. Assignments of this nature typically are difficult to define, require sophisticated research technique, or involve the development of new or unconventional methods or approaches, etc.

The GS-14 level is not met. The scope of assignments at this level typically occurs within the hierarchy of a large, complex operation, the responsibilities characteristically encompass two or more programs of a size similar to those assigned at the GS-13 level.

The GS-13 level is credited.

#### **B. TECHNICAL COMPLEXITY:**

The incumbent analyzes information and prepares studies reports concerning the economic costs, benefits, and impacts of environmental quality enhancement. Tasks include evaluation, acquisition, maintenance, and application of data and models to estimate the levels and distribution of changes. The incumbent develops plans and maintains systems to assimilate existing and emerging economic data into regulation development, implementation, and environmental progress communication programs, studies may be multimedia in nature and carried out at the regional and national levels. In addition, such studies may be used as an input in the establishment of certain standards, attainment dates, or prioritizing unfinished environmental business. Reviews environmental, economic, and financial literature to develop, maintain, and enhance the information base necessary to conduct independent analyses of the regional, national, and international aspects of environmental quality management issues.

The GS-12 level is exceeded, the demanding technical requirements of the GS-12 assignments result from the necessity of relating the immediate assignment into broader patterns of responsibility. These widening patterns may relate, in some cases, to the broad agency program and, in others, to wide theoretical concepts. The distinction in the technical



difficulty can be recognized by the increase in the number and subtlety of the variables involved, by the need for modification and adaptation of methods or for the innovation of new techniques or procedures, and by the necessity for deeper understanding and insight into the implication of findings.

Whereas at the GS-13 level, assignments require the conceptualization of large or complex economic problems typically presenting unprecedented aspects. Characteristic of these assignments at this level involve the development and application of new techniques and original methods of attack to the solution of important and unusual problems, requiring the application of a high degree of insight to isolate and define critical features of the problem; the application of considerable originality and ingenuity in adapting extending and synthesizing existing theory, principle or technique into new patterns, etc.

The GS-14 level is not met. At this level the incumbent are almost entirely dependent on their own personal professional knowledge and imagination in the assessment and understanding of problems of critical important to the organization/agency. As such typically solution to such problems often requires originality and creativity in the development of plans, design of experiments, invention of methods or the extension of existing theory to new and unusual application, etc.

The GS-13 level is credited.

#### C. TECHNICAL RESPONSIBILITY:

The incumbent assignments are either self-generated or received in accordance with established workflow channels. The incumbent carries out work independently, interpreting policy and regulations in accordance with established objectives, resolving most conflicts, which arise, and coordinating with others as required. Completed work normally is accepted as technically accurate and is reviewed for conformance with policy.

The GS-12 level is exceeded, at this level; the economist is an independent professional responsible for each step of the investigative process and accountable not only for the factual accuracy of his results but also for the thoroughness of his research plan and the cogency of his interpretations. He/she must be able to recognize and evaluate significant and critical factors, to solve complex problems and to draw rational inferences based on research findings.

Whereas at the GS-13 level. Economist works with a noticeable degree of professional independence and technical authority. He/she are responsible not only for the thoroughness of the research but also for the significance of the findings and the effectiveness of the presentations. Work performed is expected to be a finished product, reflecting a high degree of professional competence as to accuracy and critical evaluation.

The GS-14 level is not met. At this level, the incumbent is expected to locate and explore the most fruitful areas of research in relation to the agency's program and needs and take complete responsibility for formulating and carrying through research plans and assume full technical responsibility for the



interpretation and application of findings; and to develop and present budget recommendations to support these plans.

#### The GS-13 level is credited.

#### D. ADMINISTRATIVE RESPONSIBILITY:

The supervisor makes initial assignments in the form of functional responsibilities together with broad overall objectives and special assignments (as required) in the form of sensitive or special projects. The incumbent serves as senior economist responsible for providing technical and policy advice to Agency Economists and policy makers about the underpinnings to the scientific, economic, and other technical assumptions underlying the benefits and economic analyses. In cooperation with other EPA scientists, economists, and managers; plans and develops the economic, technical, scientific, and policy basis for benefits and economic analyses. Participates in Agency-wide assessments of the costs, benefits, and economic impacts of environmental programs and development of policies, methodologies, and models. The incumbent carries out work independently, interpreting policy and regulations in accordance with established objectives, resolving most conflicts, which arise, and coordinating with others as required. Completed work normally is accepted as technically accurate and is reviewed for conformance with policy.

**Subject position exceeds the GS-12 level**. At this level, economists, subject to supervisory approval, are responsible for recommending the initiation, development, or revision of projects or studies within the framework of established agency programming and policy. Freedom in decisions of this nature may often be limited by budget considerations, which are not normal responsibilities at this level. In addition, the professional responsibility inherent at this level, however, is for the optimum use of available resources e.g., money, men, and machines, etc., in meeting the requirements of programmed research. Further, independent decisions are somewhat limited by budget considerations which are not normal responsibilities at this level.

Whereas at the GS-13 level. The economist is responsible for identifying defining, and selecting specific problems for study and for determining the most fruitful investigations to undertake, however, the assignment is subject to the supervisor approval. Never the less the incumbent is accountability for the soundness of value judgments reflected in recommendations relative to proposed studies, changes in technical procedures and regulations, alteration in the direction of programmed research, and matters of similar difficulty and importance.

The GS-14 level is not met. At this level, the incumbent is expected to locate and explore the most fruitful areas of research in relation to the agency's program and needs and take complete responsibility for formulating and carrying through research plans and assume full technical responsibility for the interpretation and application of findings; and to develop and present budget recommendations to support these plans.

#### The GS-13 level is credited.

#### E. POLICY RESPONSIBILITY:

The incumbent provides technical support and expertise on benefit, cost, and economic impact models to regional, State, and local agencies, international agencies, Tribal agencies, and the public on the benefits and costs of improving air quality. This include providing technical authority in an economic field relevant to conducting research and development or performing analyses of air pollution-related problems and issues. The

00

work results in standards, criteria, regulations, processes for controlling air pollution or resolving-air-pollution-related problems.

The GS-12 level is exceeded. As reflect in the standard at the GS-11 level, the primary responsibility is for the technical validity of findings, and economists at this level rarely have any responsibility for policy recommendations. They however, on occasional submit reports, analyses and interpretations which higher echelons incorporate into policy recommendations.

Whereas at the GS-13 level, which is the lowest level at which a professional economist is the Federal service is expected to provide technical advice which is relied on in decisions concerning official Government action intended to affect important aspect of the economy of the nation.

The GS-14 is not met. At this level, the incumbent serve as authoritative technical advisors, in the highest councils of Government. He/she contribute technical information regarding the state of the economy, informed interpretation of observed economic phenomena, and evaluation and forecasts of economic movements, etc. GS-14 economists are responsible for seeing that policy makers are provided with accurate, meaningful, and properly evaluated and understood economic information.

The GS-13 level is credited.

IV. Final classification determination: Economist, GS-0110-13.

V.FLSA determination: This position is exempt under the criteria established in 5CFR 551.208.

VI. Functional Code 31

A. L. Brinkley Contract Classification Specialist FPMI Solutions, Inc.

Date: 01/11/16

Appendix D - EPA-AFG	GE Remote Work Application/Agreement						
Employee Name: Elizabeth Selbst	Job Title & Grade: Economist, GS-13						
AAship/Region and Division: Office of Air and Radiation/OAQPS/AQPD	Address of Official Agency Worksite: 109 TW Alexander Dr, Research Triangle Park, NC 27711						
Employee's Work Phone: 919.541.3918	Employee's Work E-mail Address: selbst.elizabeth@epa.gov						
First-line Supervisor: Elizabeth Palma	First-line Supervisor's Work Phone: palma.elizabeth@epa.gov						
Proposed Start Date: 04/24/22	If Temporary, Proposed End Date:						
Address of Remote Work Location (Including city, state	and zip code):						
Within same Locality Pay Area of Official Agency Work Yes No [Changes to an LPA may take significant time to provide the content of the conte	rocess. Pending Agency processing, interim arrangements may be used.]						
Phone Number: 203.219.7450	Alternate Phone Number (if available):						
Request:							
	t for Modification to Existing Agreement						
Check if for temporary period: Temporary							
Section 2. Employee's Approved Schedule: Approved S	hedule Attached. Future schedule changes will be approved through the						
Section 3. Safety Certification							
1 · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Safety Certification: The "Employee Self-Certification Safety Checklist" identifies significant safety standards that must be met to seek approval for Remote Work. The employee will notify the supervisor if anything changes at the location and submit a new "Employee Self-Certification Safety Checklist," if applicable.						
Section 4. Employee Certification and Signature							
Agreement. I agree to comply with the terms of the Article	erstand the EPA-AFGE Remote Work Article and this Remote Work and will work in accordance with this Remote Work Agreement. I will adhere ave, and responsibilities for government equipment and records. I have the duty station.						
Remote Work Training taken on 7/22/19 acceptable until Remote Training developed.)	_ date (if available) and evidence attached. (Telework Training						

Explain how you can perform all of your duties as effectively from the RWL as fre approval of this request will not diminish the Agency's ability to accomplish its many complex to accomplish the Agency's ability to accomplish the Agency's accompl				
Liz has worked as the ozone transport policy lead under the Agency's "maxiwork is 100% portable and she has demonstrated the ability to work remote quality, quantity, timeliness, customer service, and all aspects of accomplish demonstrated by serving as the Tier 1 rule lead for the 2015 ozone transpormultiple EPA Offices, briefing senior Agency leadership, and completing intereceived the highest possible summary performance ratings of "Outstanding 2021. Liz will remain in regular contact with coworkers in all EPA Offices by MS Teams. Her tour of duty is aligned with core Eastern time zone business addition, she will utilize a Maxiflex schedule to remain available for key mee hours. The proposed RWL is outside the local commuting area and provides approximately \$4,600 (see attached for detailed cost analysis). Liz is willing Approval/Disapproval (attach documentation):  Approved Disapproved (cite reason(s) below)	ly with equal effectiveness with respect to hing EPA's mission. This ability is at FIP, which requires collaborating with staff in ernal and external review processes. She great for FY 2020 and "Distinguished" for FY utilizing phone, emails, instant messages, and is hours to minimize disruption to coworkers. In things outside of regularly scheduled duty is an annual cost savings to the Agency of			
Employee's Signature:  Clighth & Albert SELBST Date: 2022.03.15 15:01:09 -04'00'	Date: 3/15/22			
Supervisor's Signature:  ELIZABETH PALMA PALMA Date: 2022.03.20 18:19:20 -04'00'  Date: 3/20/2022				
AA/RA (or designee) Signature:	Date:			
<b>Distribution:</b> The supervisor and the employee should keep a copy of this form for the the program/regional office remote work coordinator.	rir own records. A copy shall also be forwarded to			

#### **PRIVACY ACT STATEMENT**

**<u>Authority</u>**: The Telework Enhancement Act of 2010 (December 9, 2010); Public Law 111–292.

**<u>Purpose</u>**: The information collected may be used to contact EPA personnel for the purposes of conducting business.

**Routine Use**: This information may be disclosed to a Federal, State, local agency, or other public authorities where necessary or pursuant to the Routine Uses outlined in the Privacy Act System of Records: Remote Work Application/Agreement Records.

**<u>Disclosure</u>**: The information you are providing is voluntary. However, failure to provide this information will prevent the EPA from approving or further processing your remote work application/agreement.

### **ROUTING SHEET – REQUEST FOR REMOTE WORK**

**Instructions:** After receiving a remote work application, first line supervisors are to provide the information necessary to fully review the remote work request.

Once the information below is complete, this form should be:

- Signed off by the first line supervisor.
- This document should then be submitted, along with the remote work application, to your organization's designated point of contact **within 7 days** of the employee's submission of remote work application to the supervisor.

Name of employee requesting remote work:	Elizabeth Selbst
Employee title/series/grade and any informal title (e.g. Physical Scientist - OSC):	Economist, GS-0110-13/07
EPA Program or Region	EPA/OAR/OAQPS/AQPD/GSG
EPA Office location:	RTP
Employee Bargaining Union (if applicable)	AFGE
Distance, in miles (as the crow flies), between EPA office location and employee's proposed remote work location (RWL). Calculate here:	633 miles

	Section 1: Portability of Work	YES	NO
1	Is 100% of the employee's work portable?	V	
	If you marked "No" to question #1, please explain:		
2	Are the employee's duties likely to change in the future?		V
	If you marked "Yes" to question #2, please explain:		
3	Can the employee perform all of their tasks and work assignments at least equally effectively at the remote work location (considering quality, quantity, speed, manner of performance, other factors)?	V	
	If you marked "No" to question #3, please explain:		
4	Would approving the proposed remote work location require reassignment of current work or tasks to other staff?  Please ensure you are considering all tasks (e.g. mail, records management)		V

	If you marked "Yes" to question #4, please explain:				
5	Estimate how often (per year) the employee's work requires access to in-office resources (e.g. PIV Card, IT services, GOV, field equipment, paper files, etc.)?	4 t	iη	nes	
	Section 2: Remote Work Location and Cost Analysis				
6	Is employee's proposed RWL address within 50 miles of the office (calculated above)?			V	
7	If this is a renewal, please include the actual number of trips from the RWL to the EPA office during a typical year:	N/	A	***************************************	
8	Does the employee's proposed RWL affect the current locality pay?	V			
	If you marked "yes" to question #8, please describe the different in salary amounts indicating whether the RWL will be a cost savings or increased expense.  GS-13/7 (decreased expense): -\$4,620 Salary Table 2022-RA (incorporating the 2.2% GS increase and 20.94% locality pay) = \$117,8 Salary Table 2022-RUS (incorporating the 2.2% GS increase and 16.20% locality pay) = \$113				
9	<b>In addition to trips needed to access in-house resources</b> estimate the annual number of trips from the proposed remote work location to the EPA office per year:	C	)		
10	Estimate travel costs for each trip into the official agency worksite (i.e. office), in accordance with EPA travel guidance. CONCUR can be a good tool for estimating the cost of travel. Please note, local travel, travel within 50 miles of the official agency worksite, still requires pre-approval by a supervisor and the most cost-effective mode of travel.  Lodging (4 x \$115) = \$460  M&IE (3*64+2*48) = \$288  Airfare (2*114) = \$228  Mileage (to airport)= \$151 (258 miles *58.5 cents per mile)  Misc/Other = \$250				
	<ul> <li>Please describe and estimate any increase or decrease in field travel costs, considering proposed RWL (if applicable):</li> </ul>	\$ N/A			
11	Annual transit subsidy costs at the regular work site (if applicable)?	\$ N/	Ą		
	Section 3: Continued Effectiveness				
12	Would approving the remote work location cause any disruptions to communications with internal or external clients/customers (e.g. public, state and local entities, stakeholders)?			V	
	If you marked "Yes" to question #12, please explain:				

			3 * 3 4 *	YES	NO
20	Based on the criteria evaluate   remote work request?	d above, do you have any concerns rega	raing this		V
	If you marked "Yes" to question	on #20, please explain:			
		es and how they will be performed in a	-		
may e	enter this information below or	attach as a supplementary document i	n the Remote	e Work F	ackage.
pollu • Cod Fede deve	tion agencies in implementing the nordinates transport-related policy ar ral agencies, and works closely with Ioping policies and guidance.	and other support to assist EPA Regional officational interstate transport program.  Indicate the development with other OAQPS of the development with other OAQPS of the development with other OAQPS of the development of t	divisions, EPA nterested stake	offices, a holders i	ind n
• Coo	ordinate and facilitate bi-weekly (or be meetings.	as needed) division transport team meetings,	cross-office m	eetings, ı	regional
impa • Coo - Pre	cts associated with transport plans. ordinate resolution of cross-cutting i pare and present briefings and/or c	nterstate transport policy issues. ommunications materials to internal and exter	rnal stakeholde	ers.	1
		, Senior Policy Advisors and Division Director	as needed/dire	ected.	
FIRST	LINE SUPERVISOR:				
	·	ation I provided above and certify that the			
		ief. I will submit the form to my organiza nat "I have reviewed your application for			
	rded it for further processing."			,	
Eliz	zabeth W. Palma	ELIZABETH Digitally signed by ELIZABETH PALMA Date: 2022.03.20 18:38:34-04'00'	3/20/	/202	2
Printe	ed Name	Signature	Date		
DECIE	DING OFFICIAL:				
	reviewing the information prov prove.	ided, my preliminary thoughts on the ab	ove request a	are:	
	zabeth A. Shaw				
Printe	d Name	Signature	Date		•

# Ex. 3 - 5 U.S.C. § 7114(b)(4)

From: "Krebs, Ken" < krebs.ken@epa.gov > Date: July 13, 2022 at 4:46:46 PM EDT
To: "Shaw, Betsy" < Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov >

Cc: "Palma, Elizabeth" <Palma.Elizabeth@epa.gov>, "Howell, Joyce" <Howell.Joyce@epa.gov>, "Davis,

Nikki" <davis.nikki@epa.gov>, "Selbst, Elizabeth" <selbst.elizabeth@epa.gov>

Subject: Remote Work Denial Step One Grievance, Elizabeth Selbst

## AFGE LOCAL 3347 Research Triangle Park, NC

TO: Elizabeth Shaw, EPA Office of Air and Radiation, Deputy Assistant Administrator

FROM: Ken Krebs, President, AFGE Local 3347

SUBJECT: Step One Grievance, Elizabeth Selbst

DATE: 13 July 2022

AFGE Local 3347 is filing this grievance on behalf of Elizabeth Selbst in accordance with the provisions of Article 22 of the Interim Collective Bargaining Agreement. Elizabeth Selbst works in EPA's Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards, Air Quality Policy Division.

Elizabeth Selbst submitted her Remote Work application to her supervisor, Elizabeth Palma, on 15 March 2022. Elizabeth Selbst received notice of the denial and a written justification of the denial of her Remote Work request from you as the deciding official on 14 June 2022. The denial of Elizabeth Selbst's Remote Work request is unreasonable and based upon factually incorrect assumptions and, therefore, violates Section 10.A of the Remote Work article.

To resolve this matter, the Local is requesting that Elizabeth Selbst's Remote Work request be approved, and that Elizabeth Selbst continue working remotely full-time until the application is approved.

Please direct all communications regarding this matter directly to me as the AFGE Steward for this matter.

Thank you,

Ken Krebs

cc Elizabeth Selbst
Elizabeth Palma, Supervisory Environmental Policy Analyst
Ken Krebs, President AFGE Local 3347
Joyce Howell, Executive Vice President & Chief Negotiator, AFGE Council 238
Nikki Davis, LER

Ken Krebs
Local 3347 President
American Federation of Government Employees
E-343-04, 109 T.W. Alexander Drive
Research Triangle Park, NC 27711
(919) 541-2850
(919) 357-5465 Cell

Please consider joining your Union at: <u>Join.AFGE.org</u>

krebs.ken@epa.gov Kenneth.krebs@gmail.com

"Electric communication will never be a substitute for the face of someone who with their soul encourages another person to be brave and true."

- Charles Dickens